

## **Executive Summary**

Title: Dr

Forenames: Helen

Surname: Hanna

Name of employing

organisation:

Leeds Trinity University

## **Proposal**

**Department:** Institute of Childhood and Education

Project Title: Inclusion of migrant children in South Africa: Primary school learners' perspectives

using picturebooks and photographic methods

**Abstract:** Children are often at the forefront of working out what it means to be a new arrival

in a different country. They are in an environment that emphasises "integration" — adapting to new rules, making new friends, and possibly learning a new language. However, little research is focused on experiences of "inclusion" from these learners' perspective. Therefore, this qualitative study explores how inclusion of migrant children is understood and enacted by them and their teachers in primary schools in South Africa, a country where migration issues are at the fore in the media and on the national agenda. Building on a theoretical framework that combines notions of inclusion and migration, it draws on a 'mosaic' of methods: picturebooks, photography, observation, interviews, and key documents. It focuses in depth on small groups of pupils and teachers in one case school. In this creative and pupil-focused way it hopes to illuminate the relationships between educational inclusion and migration within multi-ethnic South Africa, and

to offer practical guidelines for inclusion in schools.



Dr Helen Hanna

BA/Leverhulme Small Research Grants - SRG 2016-17 Round

**Primary Subjects:** 

Subject

Subject Group

Social Exclusion/Inclusion and Equity Issues

Education

**Secondary Subjects:** 

Classifications

Time Periods: TimePeriod

Contemporary

Audiences: Audience

Policymakers at national level (e.g. working with Government departments, participating in public inquiries)

Policymakers at local or institutional level (e.g. membership of Research Ethics Committee)

Charities in the UK

Regional Interests: Region

Region Group

Sub-Saharan Africa Africa

**Applicant Personal Details** 

Title: Dr

Forenames: Helen

Surname: Hanna

Address: Leeds Trinity University

Brownberrie Lane

Horsforth

Town: LEEDS

Postcode: LS18 5HD

Email Address: h.hanna@leedstrinity.ac.uk

**Telephone (work):** 01132837100

**Co-Applicants:** 

## **Applicant Career Summary**

Statement of Qualifications and QualificationDatePhD (Education) - Queen's University, Belfast2014

MDiv (Theology) - Union Theological College, Belfast 2010

MA Hons (French and Russian) - Heriot-Waiit 2004

University, Edinburgh

**Present appointment:** Lecturer

Career:

Present employing

institution:

Leeds Trinity University

Present department: Institute of Childhood and Education

**Personal Statement:** 

PhD confirmation: Yes

**Publications:** Hanna, H. (2016) 'How teachers can help migrant learners feel more included'.

The Conversation Africa, 1st April 2016. Available at:

https://theconversation.com/how-teachers-can-help-migrant-learners-feel-

moreincluded-56760

Hanna, H. (2016) "Everyone has to find themselves in the story": Exploring the right to minority group representation in the citizenship curriculum in Northern Ireland and Israel". Diaspora, Indigenous and Minority Education, 10:2, 84-97.

DOI: 10.1080/15595692.2015.1084922

Hanna, H. (online January 2016) 'Dealing with difference in the divided educational context: The cases of Northern Ireland and Israel'. Compare. DOI:

10.1080/03057925.2015.1119649

Alhawsawi, S. and Hanna, H (2013) 'Post-2015 Millennium Development Goals Framework: Student Voices', Compare Special Forum on the Post-2015 Education and Development Agenda, Compare, 46:6, pp. 834-837.

Hanna, H. (2013) 'Citizenship Education within a Right to Education Framework:

the Cases of Northern Ireland and Israel', Educate, 13:1, pp. 5-10.

Unpublished research: Sayed, Y., Alhawsawi, S. and Hanna, H (forthcoming) South African Social Policy

Report (on ESRC-funded project looking at social policy and the state in BRICS

countries).

Hanna, H. (forthcoming December 2016) chapter entitled 'Developing citizenship in divided contexts' in edited edition Everyday Social Justice and Citizenship

(accepted for publication by Routledge).

Previous support

dates:

N/A

Previous support

description:

N/A

Where did you hear of

this scheme?:

Online

## Proposal

Subject: Education / Social Exclusion/Inclusion and Equity Issues

Title of project: Inclusion of migrant children in South Africa: Primary school learners' perspectives

using picturebooks and photographic methods

Abstract: Children are often at the forefront of working out what it means to be a new arrival

in a different country. They are in an environment that emphasises "integration" adapting to new rules, making new friends, and possibly learning a new language. However, little research is focused on experiences of "inclusion" from these learners' perspective. Therefore, this qualitative study explores how inclusion of migrant children is understood and enacted by them and their teachers in primary schools in South Africa, a country where migration issues are at the fore in the media and on the national agenda. Building on a theoretical framework that combines notions of inclusion and migration, it draws on a 'mosaic' of methods: picturebooks, photography, observation, interviews, and key documents. It focuses in depth on small groups of pupils and teachers in one case school. In this creative and pupil-focused way it hopes to illuminate the relationships between educational inclusion and migration within multi-ethnic South Africa, and

to offer practical guidelines for inclusion in schools.

## **Proposed programme:**

Created: Friday, September 02, 2016 18:55 [Submitted]

#### **DESCRIPTION**

This project explores understandings of inclusion of migrant pupils in primary schools in South Africa, a country where social integration and migration dominate the public agenda. It recognises that children are often at the forefront of working out what it means to be a new arrival in a different country. Their new environment emphasises "integration"; however, little research is available that adequately accesses their perspectives on school and how to help them feel included. This research aims to explore this, building on scholarship on migration and ethnoracial inclusion in schools, and a recent pilot study in South Africa and England.

South Africa has a long history of diversity and migration. Twenty-two years on from the fall of apartheid, it is grappling with the reality of xenophobic attacks, this time not against its own citizens, but against migrants. Currently there are 2.2 million people living in South Africa who were born outside of the country, and although international law officially entitles them to have their basic needs met, the state frequently fails to meet these requirements. As a way of addressing such ethnic and racial tensions, the state has emphasised national unity, and schools are targeted as sites where shared identity should be instilled. At the same time, schools have also been compelled to develop an inclusive approach to all children, irrespective of race, ethnicity, religion, home language and country of origin.

#### RESEARCH OBJECTIVE AND QUESTIONS

The overarching research objective is to explore how inclusion of recent migrant children is understood in primary schools in South Africa. The related research questions are as follows:

- 1. What understandings of inclusion are held by migrant primary school pupils and teachers and found within policy in South Africa?
- 2. What role can teachers play in helping new migrant children feel included within schools and to what extent can creative visual methods enable this?

#### **METHODS**

This qualitative project will use the popular 'Mosaic' approach (Clark 2011) that draws on multiple methods to access the understandings of children. This will include using picturebooks, photographic cameras, individual and group interviews, non-participant observations and key documents. The principal investigator (PI) will work twice a week over a period of 6 weeks in one school, researching alongside a group of 4-6 pupil-researchers aged 9-10 years. Each weekly creative session will last 60-90 minutes. She will also observe and accompany them throughout the school day once per week. Picturebooks will be used to stimulate the pupil-researchers' memories and ideas about being new at the school. They will then explore their own school experiences through taking photos of school life. Following this, the researchers together will design a fictional narrative of what it is like to be new at school, including ways that others can help them feel included, using photos and voices. Additionally, the PI will interview 3-4 teachers in the selected school. The school will be selected based on contacts made during previous pilot research and will be one which enrolls significant numbers of migrant children.

The data will be approached from an interpretivist perspective that focuses on the subjective understandings of individuals and groups. The data will be analysed thematically with the aid of MAXQDA software.

# Planned research outputs:

- 1. Two academic journal articles (Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies; Race Ethnicity and Education 8000 words each)
- 2. Two conference presentations (delivered at South African Educational Research Association Conference 2017 and British Educational Research Association Conference 2018 20 minutes each).
- 3. Audio-visual and written resources for schools detailing guidance on inclusion.

#### Plan of action:

#### APRIL 2016: PREPARING FOR FIELDWORK

- Apply for ethical approval from Leeds Trinity University, Cape Peninsula University of Technology and Western Cape Education Department (SA)
- Design information booklets and consent forms for participants
- Receive permission to do research in selected schools

MAY-JUNE 2017: FIELDWORK (SOUTH AFRICA): [Please note this time period was selected as schools run from January to December, and so conducting fieldwork later in the year would not be feasible due to the focus on assessment from September onwards]

- Collect key policy documents
- Creative fieldwork (picturebooks, photography, group interviews, photo-voice design) with and observations of pupils
- Interviews with teachers

JULY-SEP 2017: DATA ANALYSIS AND THEORETICAL DEVELOPMENT 1

- Transcription
- Data analysis
- Submit abstract to SAERA Conference 2017

# OCT 2017: DISSEMINATION 1/DATA ANALYSIS 2 AND THEORETICAL DEVELOPMENT 2

- Share preliminary findings with colleagues at Leeds Trinity University
- Oral presentation of preliminary findings at SAERA Conference 2017
- Continue data analysis

NOV 2017-FEB 2018: DATA ANALYSIS 3 AND THEORETICAL DEVELOPMENT 3

- Complete data analysis
- Return to literature
- Further develop theoretical framework

- Feed back preliminary findings to participant schools for comment
- Submit abstract to BERA Conference 2018
- Begin writing journal article 1 and 2

### MARCH 2018: DISSEMINATION 2

- Edit photovoice narratives of pupil-researchers
- Share final video resource with participant school

#### **APRIL 2018: DISSEMINATION 3**

- Submit journal article 1 to JEMS
- Continue writing journal article 2

#### SEP 2018: DISSEMINATION 4

- Oral presentation at BERA Conference 2018
- Submit journal article 2 to REE
- Submit final report to Sir Ernest Cassel Educational Trust

## Plans for publication / dissemination:

I am very keen to engage not only with academic audiences, but also with practitioners and pupils themselves, so that the greatest learning may be drawn from the findings of this research. In particular, I plan to produce the following:

- 1. Journal article in the Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies this is a key journal in the area of international migration.
- 2. Journal article in Race Ethnicity and Education this journal focuses on ethnicity in particular, and features many of the scholars whose work I draw upon.
- 3. Conference paper 1 delivered at SAERA Conference 2017 this is the central educational conference in South Africa where I can develop the research findings and insights and networks with future funding applications in mind.
- 4. Conference paper 2 delivered at BERA Conference 2018 this is the central educational conference in the UK and a vital opportunity for networking in order to develop future research funding proposals, and for considering the applicability of the findings to the UK.
- 5. Audio-visual and written resource for schools as guidance on inclusion in addition to presenting written summaries of the key findings for schools, I will, together with the pupil-researchers, devise a video that presents guidance for inclusion from their perspectives. This video will be presented during a ceremony at the selected school, either with myself in attendance or via video link/prerecorded video.

## Digital resource:

**Start Date:** 01/04/2017

**End Date:** 01/10/2018

**Duration (months):** 18

Overseas travel -South Africa

country:

Overseas travel -

country 2:

Overseas travel -

country 3:

Overseas travel -

institution:

Centre for International Teacher Education, Cape Peninsula University of

Technology, Cape Town, South Africa.

Research Leave **Granted/Permission** 

Obtained:

Permission will be obtained.

Support of BA School

or Institute

Required/Granted:

No.

Language competence

(if applicable):

All research will be conducted in English.

Other participants:

Prof Yusuf Sayed and Prof Azeem Badroodien, the South African Research Initiative Chair/Director and Deputy Director, respectively, at the Centre for International Teacher Education, Cape Peninsula University of Technology, will be playing an informal role in guiding the PI and assisting with access to schools in South Africa.

Role of other participants:

Prof Yusuf Sayed and Prof Azeem Badroodien are both highly experienced and well-known scholars who are active in the field of education in South Africa. They have previously supported the PI during her pilot research in South Africa in

2015/16.

Added value of collaboration: This collaboration between Leeds Trinity University and Cape Peninsula University of Technology will build on links already forged through the conducting of the PI's pilot research during 2015/16. Both institutions have plans for further research and teaching collaboration, including to enable students from Leeds Trinity to carry out work placements in schools in South Africa. The PI is keen to play a part in developing these links further. The collaboration is also particularly timely due to the currently high public profile of migration issues in both countries, and therefore the potential for inter-country knowledge exchange.

**Endangered or Emerging Subject** 

Area:

Ethical approval obtained:

There are a number of special ethical considerations with this research, particularly relating to working with children and researching using photography. However, there are no supplementary ethical considerations that will not be covered by the process of gaining ethical approval from Leeds Trinity University, Cape Peninsula University of Technology and Western Cape Educational Department. These applications have been factored into the timeline (see within this application). Nevertheless, for clarity, I have provided below an outline of the

main specific ethical considerations in this regard.

Ethical approval (more information):

SENSITIVITY OF TOPIC

Ethno-racial identity, migration and inclusion may be viewed as sensitive topics, particularly given recent anti-immigration rhetoric within politics and the media and racially motivated attacks in South Africa. This may mean that pupils feel

uncomfortable talking about these issues, and may feel distressed or not wish to

participate. This will be mitigated by assurances to both pupils and parents from the researcher and their class teacher of what exactly will be involved in the research, what topics will be discussed in the research group fieldwork, and of their right to opt out at any time, with no negative consequences. In the case where a pupil becomes distressed during the research process, they will be asked if they would like to leave the research environment, i.e., classroom. If so, then a pre-designated member of the school staff will be contacted immediately by telephone or other appropriate means in order to accompany the pupil out of the classroom and, if the pupil wishes, back to their timetabled class. They will be given an opportunity to discuss the matter at a later time with the researcher and class teacher, if they wish. They will also have access to their school pastoral support team.

#### INFORMED CONSENT

Prior to requesting consent from potential participants of the research, information booklets and consent forms will be offered to each individual in order to explain the research. Head teachers will be asked for their informed and signed consent for the PI to conduct research in their school. Parents will be asked for their informed and signed consent for their children to be involved, as will pupils. Both head teachers and parents will be sent a letter explaining the research in detail, followed by the consent form. Pupils will be provided with a child-friendly research information booklet for them to read to help them decide whether they wish to participate. The information booklet/letter/consent forms will include the following information:

- the purposes of the research, the details of what it will entail, including data collection format (observations, picturebooks, photography, discussions), time commitment, and location;
- that the study will be conducted in English;
- the use to which the research findings will be put (in academic research journals and presentations and making the audio-visual resources);
- the fact that research sessions will be recorded using audio recording equipment;
- their right to opt out of the research at any time during the fieldwork without providing a reason;
- their assurance of confidentiality on the part of the researcher (for children, this extends only to the assurance that what they say will not be shared with their classmates; the researcher will pass on information relevant to safeguarding when necessary to the pupils' class teacher);
- their assurance of anonymity in published material;
- that all data will be stored securely, so that only the researcher and will have access to the identifying raw data, and that ultimately notes identifying the participants will be destroyed;
- that the researcher is committed to carrying out the data collection in a sensitive and unstressful manner and that she welcomes any queries or concerns the participants may have at any stage.

**USE OF PHOTOGRAPHS** 

There are special ethical concerns with regard to the use of photography in this study that will be addressed. It is acknowledged that, given the fact that pupils will be asked to take photographs of their surroundings (of the things and people in school that are important to them and that express something about their identity), they may then take photographs without the permission of the person being photographed, or take photographs of themselves that may be regarded by significant adults as inappropriate, or that the pupils themselves then later regret taking. Such risks are not taken lightly by the researcher. However, in order to mitigate such risk, the pupils' class teacher together with the researcher will be heavily involved in the preparation sessions leading up to the taking of photographs (capacity-building classes with the pupils in learning how to use cameras and what are appropriate and non-appropriate photos), in supervision during the taking of the photographs, and when editing and selecting photographs for further discussion with the researcher. The photographs will not be published in any material emanating from the project without the full written consent of both pupils and their parents and that of any other person who appears in the photographs. Such consent will be requested following the main research fieldwork, and will be requested on a case-by-case basis when it is decided that the use of a certain photograph would be helpful for the published research.

Source of funding:

Yes, I applied for a British Academy Small Grant in the May 2016 funding round but was unsuccessful.

#### **Financial Details**

Financial details:	Year	Payment type	Justification	Amount Requested
	Year 1	Travel Costs		1,890.00
	Year 1	Accommodation		4,700.00
	Year 1	Consumables		150.00
	Year 1	Research/clerical assistance		780.00
	Year 1	Other costs		250.00
	Year 2	Travel Costs		120.00
	Year 2	Accommodation		300.00
	Year 2	Consumables		0.00
	Year 2	Research/clerical assistance		0.00
	Year 2	Other costs		300.00
	Total			8,490.00

Total grant requested: 8490.00

**Start Date:** 01/04/2017

Duration (Years): 2

#### Justification:

This project cannot be funded internally due to the fact that the PI received funding from her institution last academic year for the previous, pilot project. The funding is mainly to cover the costs of travel to and subsistence during the research period (7.5 weeks in South Africa, which includes one week for introductory meetings, and 6 weeks in schools), research assistance for transcription, and dissemination at two conferences (travel and subsistence). Please note, within 'accommodation' above, food, mobile phone credit, and internal travel have been included. Full details of costings are below:

Research assistance (transcription – £1 per minute X 780 minutes (13 hours)): £780

Return airfare UK-South Africa (for fieldwork): £900

Return taxi fare Leeds (home) to Leeds Bradford airport: £25

Return taxi fare Cape Town airport to accommodation: £20

Subsistence (accommodation, food, mobile phone credit, internal travel) in South Africa (for fieldwork) (one month @ £2,000 + 20 days @ £100 per diem, based on 10% lower than UK government recommended per diem rates for employees travelling overseas): £4000

South African Education Research Association (SAERA) Conference October 2017 – registration fees: £250

Return airfare and taxi fares Leeds to SAERA Conference 2017 (city unknown, SA): £945 (as above)

Subsistence during SAERA Conference 2017 attendance and feedback sessions to partner institution and participant school (7 nights x £100): £700

British Education Research Association (BERA) Conference September 2018 – registration fees (Northumbria University, Newcastle, UK): £300

Return train and local bus travel to BERA Conference 2018: £120

Subsistence during BERA Conference 2018 (3 nights x £100): £300

Stationery/photocopying/printing of photos for use during research: £150

TOTAL: £8490

Name of private fund:

Sir Ernest Cassel Educational Trust